



The Impact of Al-Shabr-Based Reframing Techniques on The Self-Esteem of Workplace-Bullying Victims

Anna Bella Diaz^{1*}, Suci Nugraha¹, Anna Rozana¹

¹Universitas Islam Bandung, Indonesia

Received : August 1, 2024

Revised : December 16, 2024

Accepted : December 19, 2024

Online : December 30, 2024

Abstract

Bullying occurs not only among children but also among adults, especially in the workplace. Rejection, negative treatment, and a lack of appreciation in the work environment can affect self-esteem. It is crucial to enhance self-esteem in the context of work because work takes up a significant portion of an individual's life and can impact their well-being. The application of Al-Shabr (commonly known as patience) with reframing techniques, focusing on resilience, perseverance, and steadfastness, aims to build confidence and optimism, develop resilience in facing challenges, and make efforts to overcome issues by setting new goals. This study, conducted on three workers experiencing workplace bullying and the resulting low self-esteem, used a one-group pre-test post-test design and was analyzed using the Wilcoxon test. The statistical results indicate that there are differences in results after implementing Al-Shabr-based reframing techniques, but the effect is not significant in terms of increasing the self-esteem of workers who experience bullying. The increase in scores showed that Al-Shabr-based reframing techniques had an impact on improving the self-esteem of workers who experienced bullying. Al-Shabr-based reframing techniques are promising and easy to implement but need to be tested on a wider sample.

Keywords *Self-esteem, Organization-Based Self-Esteem, Reframing, Al-Shabr Patience, Workplace Bullying*

INTRODUCTION

A meta-analysis research conducted by Verkuil et al. (2015) concluded that workplace bullying is a significant predictor of mental health problems, including symptoms of depression, anxiety, and PTSD, as well as other stress-related psychological complaints such as negative affect and emotional exhaustion. To address the potentially disruptive mental health effects of workplace bullying, understanding its potential for mental health problems (Nielsen et al., 2012). Workplace bullying should not be a single type of offense, violence, or abusive behavior. It can take the form of unfriendly behavior, impractical deadlines, taunting, separation, dismissal, unattainable goals, sabotaging, threats, professional elimination, condemnation, and humiliation (Suggala et al., 2020). Workplace bullying can also take the form of slander, verbal hostility, constant criticism, and social exclusion (Nielsen et al., 2012). This occurred because of the conspicuous difference between reprimand and criticism and the treatment received.

This research focuses on those who are oppressed, namely, victims of bullying because based on the cycle of bullying and the realities in the environment, victims of bullying are the ones who suffer the most and feel the long-term impact. Workers who experience bullying at work tend to feel low self-esteem and are continually targeted by destructive and undesirable social actions (Einarsen et al., 2002). In line with this, Brown (2010) stated that individuals with low self-esteem are usually hesitant to express themselves and have difficulty maintaining satisfying relationships; thus, they are more likely to experience rejection and become targets or victims of bullying.

Self-esteem should be studied in individuals who experience bullying. This is because self-esteem is an internal protective factor. Protective factors help individuals cope with pressure and enable them to deal with unpleasant conditions and adapt to threatening situations (Ibeagha et al., 2004). Pierce et al. (1989) developed a construct related to specific self-esteem in the context of



work, in which individuals assess that they are important, meaningful, and valuable in relation to the roles they have in their work. This construct is referred to as OBSE (Organization Based Self-Esteem).

Cognitive intervention is an intervention that is considered effective in improving self-esteem because [those suffering from low self-esteem] have problems in their cognitive processes, namely, there are errors in their thinking patterns (not objective and unrealistic) in viewing themselves and their environment (Wanders et al., 2008). Self-esteem is a self-evaluation, and has an essence that lies in negative basic beliefs about oneself. These basic beliefs involve individual cognition. In some psychological literature, cognitive counseling has been provided with reframing techniques that are effectively used to overcome various psychological problems, especially in victims of bullying.

One of the studies conducted by Stark et al. (2022) used reframing techniques on students who had experienced bullying by retelling their experiences but framing them in terms of fortitude and resilience. In line with this research, one of the most striking aspects of self-esteem is the strength of survival and the ability to face obstacles as a topic for social scientists and medical doctors (Mruk, 2006). In addition, it is important to emphasize resilience in individuals who are bullied. By building and discovering the power of the self, individuals can achieve self-transformation after experiencing stress. The positive elements mentioned earlier, such as the ability to face obstacles, realize one's strengths, fortitude, and the power of survival, are also discussed in the concept of patience in Islamic psychology, which is also known as Al-Shabr. In psychology, the term often used to describe this concept is patience. Therefore, the use of the term "patience" in this study was intended to facilitate the understanding of readers who are more familiar with the terminology. Both terms refer to the same principle: the ability to persevere and manage emotions positively despite adversity.

This approach piques the researchers' interest in emphasizing the same approach adopted by Stark et al. (2022), namely, using reframing techniques with the Islamic concept of patience. This study aims to determine whether using Islamic concepts in providing reframing to individuals who experience bullying can have a positive impact on thoughts, mood, and self-confidence, thus contributing to psychological well-being. This is the primary mission of Islamic psychology, aimed not only at restoring and treating mental health but also at increasing one's faith and piety. The main purpose of this approach is to actualize a Muslim person who is both devout and righteous (Arroisi et al., 2024).

The Association of American Medical Colleges defines spirituality as follows: "Spirituality is a factor that contributes to health in many persons. The concept of spirituality is found in all cultures and societies. It is expressed in an individual's search for ultimate meaning" (Sarkingobir et al., 2022). This trend tends to be especially prevalent in Asian cultures because religiosity and spirituality are important components of these cultures. In addition, few studies have used religion-based reframing techniques, and no research has been conducted on workers who experience bullying, especially how it affects their self-esteem. Therefore, this research project aims to provide insight into the extent to which the use of patience in reframing techniques can be an effective intervention for increasing self-esteem.

Psychologically, patience is a dynamic defense mechanism to overcome the tests that befall humans as servants and at the same time as caliphs on earth. Three important keys of patience are firm in one's stance, steadfast in facing obstacles or difficulties, and diligent in pursuing what one expects, based on moral and ethical considerations (Yusuf, 2010). The provision of patience-based reframing techniques to victims of bullying who have low self-esteem aims to enable individuals to see themselves from a different and more positive perspective. The explanation of the concept of patience with a faith-based approach is to implement the verses of the Qur'an based on aspects of

firm, steadfast, and persevering in facing the events experienced and finding sources of self-esteem integrated in reframing techniques to increase the self-esteem of individuals who experience bullying in the workplace.

This research contributes considerably to our understanding of how the reframing technique based on patience can have a positive impact on thinking patterns, mood, and self-confidence. This can enhance self-esteem and serve as a protective factor against mental health difficulties. By applying the reframing technique based on patience, it is hoped that negative attitudes toward oneself, lack of confidence in expressing opinions, and lack of courage to take risks and other behaviors that illustrate low self-esteem will no longer appear. Workers realize and understand the potential in themselves. By increasing self-esteem as an individual internal protective factor, workers can hopefully survive the bullying situation they face or after experiencing the bullying, namely, as self-protection. In addition, it is hoped that increasing workers' self-esteem will affect mental well-being.

It is expected that workers who enjoy mental well-being can survive in the work environment they experience because work is the key to identity and the center of life for individuals amid the difficulty of finding work and facing economic problems. Moreover, improving spiritual values is also beneficial in increasing job satisfaction to a higher level, which motivates people to become more productive and thus has a significant impact on upgrading economic productivity and social welfare (Ramilan et al., 2024).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Self-Esteem

According to Rosenberg et al. (1995), self-esteem is a person's attitude based on perceptions of how he values and assesses himself as a whole, which is in the form of a positive or negative attitude toward himself. Mruk (2006) asserts that self-esteem is a series of individual attitudes about what they think about themselves based on perceived feelings, namely, a feeling of self-worth and satisfaction.

Global and Specific Self-Esteems

Rosenberg et al. (1995) divided self-esteem into global and specific self-esteem. Global self-esteem is defined as a person's general sense of worthiness, which is most relevant to the person's psychological well-being. In contrast, specific self-esteem has been defined as an individual's thoughts or feelings toward a particular feature of the self (e.g., academic, social, or sexual self-esteem), which is most relevant to the individual's behavior. The more specifically self-esteem is defined, the greater the predictive power of self-esteem on an individual's behavior related to a particular attribute or domain of evaluation. Global self-esteem scales tend to be appropriate for research on individuals in the context of overall life events, but specific measures of self-esteem—measures that reveal worthiness in a particular activity—are more appropriate for very specific behaviors.

Organizational-Based Self-Esteem

Rosenberg et al. (1995) developed specific self-esteem in academic fields. Based on this, Pierce et al. (1989) developed it further from these two constructs, namely, related to self-esteem in work. Pierce et al. (1989) directed this research effort toward the development and initial validation of a self-esteem measure, with the hope that the measure would allow researchers to better examine the effects of self-esteem in relation to work.

Pierce et al. (1989) stated that organizational-based self-esteem in the context of the workplace is the value perceived by individuals as important, meaningful, and valuable in relation

to their roles in the workplace. OBSE denotes the level of belief a person has that they are capable, significant, and worthy. Capable of being able to face the challenges in their work, 'significant' refers to feeling an important part of the workplace, and 'worthy' refers to feeling valuable while at work. Workers with high OBSE feel competent in achieving their goals. Workers will feel confident in their abilities to face challenges and be able to survive if they experience failure (Pierce & Gardner, 2004).

Factors Influencing Organizational Self-Esteem

Pierce et al. (1989) determined that there are three categories of organizational experiences that shape the self-perception of an individual's worthiness in the organization. These factors are similar to the power possessed by self-esteem but still based on the individual's work and organizational experiences (Pierce & Gardner, 2004). These factors are categorized as follows:

1. Work Environment

When a structured work environment is strictly enforced, individuals perceive that their ideas are not valuable and struggle with self-regulation. When self-regulation is not successful, individuals will believe that they are not trusted and question their ability to exercise self-direction and self-control, leading to feelings of incompetence in the workplace. Whenever we act well or in a way that is recognized as adhering to reasonable standards of what is desirable, healthy, or "good", we also find ourselves worthy because our actions express who we are in these situations. Of course, failure to do so has a negative impact on self-esteem (Mruk, 2006).

2. Social Support

When individuals receive messages or information from significant others (leaders, superiors, or coworkers) that they have done a good job supporting their workplace and know their achievements, their organizational-based self-esteem should increase. Bosses who control workers and direct them strictly have a negative impact because the messages conveyed to workers are interpreted as a form of incompetence and inadequacy of workers in doing work. Acceptance is a source of self-esteem because it relates to worthiness. This means that others value us in the same way, whether through expressions of attention, respect, or even love. Similarly, rejection, such as being ignored, belittled, taken advantage of, mistreated, or abandoned, can negatively impact self-esteem. In all cases, we deal with interpersonal events in terms of whether one is valued by others.

3. Individual Feelings

This is related to the efficacy and competence derived from personal experience and direct experience. Individuals who have feelings of efficacy and competence derived from experiences such as successful work or projects undertaken will maintain a positive self-image (Pierce & Gardner, 2004). Individual meaningfulness, which concerns how much the individual believes that he/she is capable of meaningful, and capable according to his/her personal standards and judgments. This appreciation is what self-meaningfulness means. Individuals who can do something with their standards and realize their aspirations so that they can develop into people with high levels of self-esteem. Individuals who find that they do not possess the traits desired by their ideals, do not realize their capacities, have an unrealistic attitude toward their lives, and easily feel dissatisfied are likely to have low feelings of self-esteem.

Workplace Bullying

Einarsen et al. (2002) described workplace bullying as involving repeated negative actions and practices directed at one or more workers. The behavior is undesirable toward the target and is carried out in circumstances where the target has difficulty defending himself. This behavior can be carried out as an intentional act or unconsciously. It causes humiliation, offense, and distress to the target. The bullying behavior causes clinically significant distress and impairment in social,

occupational, and other areas of functioning. [Einarsen et al. \(2002\)](#) defined workplace bullying as harassing, offending, excluding someone socially, or having a negative impact on someone's work duties. For a bullying label to apply to a particular activity, interaction, or process, it must occur repeatedly and regularly (e.g. weekly) and over a certain period of time (e.g. approximately six months).

Workplace Bullying Categories

According to [Nielsen et al. \(2009\)](#), workplace bullying can be categorized into 3, namely:

1. Work-related bullying

[Nielsen et al. \(2009\)](#) defined workplace bullying as all repeated acts and practices directed at one or more workers, unwanted by the victim, which may be done intentionally or unconsciously but clearly cause humiliation, offense, and distress. Work-related bullying includes the assignment of difficult tasks, unreasonable deadlines, uncontrollable workload, assignment of meaningless tasks, provision of unclear information, and threats to worker safety.

2. Person-related bullying

Negative effects on workers' health caused by stress can potentially lead to psycho-physical symptoms, mood and personality changes, psychiatric disorders, such as anxiety-depressive disorders, chronic adjustment disorders, and post-traumatic stress. [Nielsen et al. \(2009\)](#) stated that bullying is related to individuals, such as public humiliation, ignoring, spreading rumors or gossip, invading privacy, and shouting at others.

3. Physically Intimidating Bullying

[Leymann \(1990\)](#) mentions that although workplace bullying is related to negative behaviors that are psychological in nature, research involving targets of workplace bullying has revealed that physical acts of bullying, and in some cases even physical violence or threats of violence, are part of a wider repertoire of aggressive actions applied in cases of bullying. Negative behaviors such as yelling, subjecting co-workers to spontaneous anger, finger pointing, invasion of privacy, pushing, blocking the way, threats of violence, and other physical abuse.

Reframing Technique

Reframing is a technique in counseling that is used to process a person's emotional level in their mind and reframe it toward a rational mind to understand various self-concepts and cognitive perspectives in various situations ([Palmer, 2010](#)). Reframing is an approach that changes the perspective of the counselee to renew or rebuild the counselee's understanding of the problem or behavior ([Cormier & Cormier, 1985](#)).

The purpose of the reframing technique is

Reframing aims to help counselees see problematic situations from a different perspective to increase their openness to solutions. According to [Cormier and Cormier \(1985\)](#), the focus of reframing is on reasons and false beliefs. The goal is to change irrational beliefs or negative self-statements.

Stages of the Reframing Technique

Reframing techniques are provided in the counseling process to provide and change the frame of thinking with a more positive point of view so that there is an understanding that there are many perspectives to address problems. [Cormier and Cormier \(1985\)](#) mention the following six stages of reframing techniques:

1. Rational

The rationale used in the reframing strategy convinces the counselee that wrong perceptions or thoughts can cause emotional distress.

2. Identify the perceptions and feelings of the counselee about their experience of a problem

Perception identification is a stage used to identify perceptions or thoughts that arise in situations that cause problems at hand. The perception identification stage also aims to help in dealing with problem situations. At the same time, the counselor attempts to observe the feelings and responses of the counselor during the perception identification process.

3. The role of perception as a source of problems

Once the counselee is aware of what is of concern, they are asked to recall a problem situation and the perceptions that arose toward the situation and deliberately confront selected features that they have processed automatically.

4. Identification of alternative perceptions

At this stage, the counselor can help the counselee change the focus of his/her attention by selecting other features of the problem at hand. The goal is for the counselee to select other images of the behavior at hand. The counselor directs the counselee to make other perceptions about the problems he is experiencing.

5. Modification and perception in problem situations

The counselor can guide the counselee to another point of view from the problem situation. The goal is for the counselee to create new responses and observations designed to break the old model formulation and lay the draft for a new, more effective formulation.

6. Homework and its completion

The counselor encourages the counselee to apply what they have done during the counseling process to their real lives.

Patience

Patience (*kesabaran* in Indonesian) comes from the Arabic word *Al-Shabr* or *Shobaro*. *Shobaro'ala* means to be patient or steadfast; *Shabara'an* means to beg or prevent; and *Shabarabihi* means to bear. Allah commands believers to exercise patience in all aspects of life. Patience is a highly regarded quality in Islam, and one of the attributes of Allah is *Al-Saboer*, which literally means the most patient (Zulfeqar, 2024).

Patience can be defined as the ability to organize, control, direct (thoughts, feelings and actions), and overcome various difficulties in a comprehensive and integrative manner (Yusuf, 2020). "Comprehensive" in this sense is being able to capture (accept) problems well; have broad and complete information (about the scope or content); and show broad insight into the problems faced. Meanwhile, the word "integrative" means being able to see problems in an integrated manner (Yusuf, 2020)

Patient Aspect

Firmness

The meaning of patience in the context of firm stance cannot be separated from a strong determination to deliver his orders. This is stated in surah an-Nahl (16): 42, which reads: "(i.e.) those who are patient and to God alone do they put their trust". Resilience will lead practitioners to be brave despite trials and not avoid them. Firmness can be achieved by putting one's trust in Allah, which is not only surrendering to Allah's provision but also trying to face all trials with obedience and sincere intentions.

In addition, QS. Al-Baqarah verses 155-156 which reads: And indeed, We will give you trials, with a little fear, hunger, lack of wealth, soul and fruit. and give good news to those who are patient.

(Those) who, when afflicted with calamity, say, "*Inna lillahi wa innaa ilaihi raaji'uun*" (Indeed we belong to Allah and to Him is our return). This is because hardship and suffering can awaken hidden strengths and can open hearts to doors that they would not have known about except when they were confronted with adversity. Steadfastness includes the following principles: (1) optimism; (2) courage to take risks; (3) obeying the rules; (4) orderly in carrying out the rules (Yusuf, 2020).

Steadfastness

Steadfastness refers to strength in facing (trials, dangers, tests, difficulties). Steadfastness is also defined as persistence and bravery (in the face of danger; courageous despite trials and difficulties). Steadfastness describes psychological resilience in the form of endurance, fighting power, tolerance for frustration, ability to learn from failure, and willingness to accept feedback to improve oneself (Yusuf, 2020). As for the aspect of steadfastness, QS. Al-Anbiya verse 35 which reads "We test you with badness and goodness as a trial; to Us you return." Trials in life are actually interpreted as a sign that a person is a strong, resilient human being. The more difficult the level of the test one faces, the higher the level of degree one attains, as illustrated by "Because: Indeed, after hardship there is ease. Indeed, after difficulty there is ease" (QS. Al-Inshirah verses 5 and 6);

Perseverance

Perseverance means being determined, firm in one's stance, diligent, enterprising, earnest, and persistent in working despite difficulties, obstacles, and hurdles. This persevering nature is manifested in a sustainable spirit and does not slack despite the many obstacles that stand in the way. In perseverance, in addition to the need for anticipation or alertness, it is also required to always have a plan, as well as focus on facing the task or job (Yusuf, 2020). In the aspect of perseverance, QS. Ar-Ra'd verse 11 which reads "Allah does not change the state of a people so that they change the state that is in themselves ...". This verse aims to show that humans must continue to work hard to face the various problems and sufferings they face.

According to Rosenberg (1995), self-esteem is a person's attitude based on perceptions of how he values and assesses himself as a whole, which is in the form of a positive or negative attitude toward himself. Mruk (2006) asserts that self-esteem is a series of individual attitudes about what they think about themselves based on perceived feelings, namely, a feeling of self-worth and satisfaction.

RESEARCH METHOD

Study Population

The population comprises all research subjects meeting certain criteria. In this study, the population consisted of individuals who met the following criteria:

1. Age between 20 and 40 years. At this age, one of the developmental tasks that need to be fulfilled is working. People are expected to have a job to fulfill basic needs such as clothing, food, and shelter. In addition, young adulthood is characterized by a period of adjustment to adopting new roles, attitudes and values
2. Workers who experience bullying in the workplace, occurring repeatedly and within a certain period of time (at least 6 months)
3. They exhibit characteristics such as low self-esteem, lack of confidence, pessimism, hesitation in expressing feelings and opinions, fear of decision-making, and concern about others' judgments.
4. Muslim
5. Willing to follow the counseling until the end.

The sampling was conducted using the non-probability sampling method. In this method, the population size is not known with certainty; thus, the sampling process is not randomized. The technique used is purposive sampling, that is, sampling after selection. The selection intended for this study comprises workers who experience bullying in the workplace in accordance with the criteria for low self-esteem.

The number of subjects who fit the criteria and are willing to follow the counseling series until the end amounts to 3 people. This study employed an idiographic research strategy. Barlow and Nock (2009) argued that the flexibility and efficiency of this design make it suitable for use by psychological scientists, clinicians, and students, given that it requires relatively short time and few resources and subjects, yet can provide strong evidence of causal relationships between variables. Thus, when three subjects received repeated interventions under controlled conditions, the findings demonstrated strong experimental control and contributed to understanding the mechanism of change.

Ethical Considerations

This study adhered to the ethical guidelines for research involving human participants. Before participation, all participants were given clear information regarding the purpose, procedures, and potential risks of the study, especially the emotional distress that could arise from discussing sensitive issues such as workplace bullying. To protect the participants' privacy, their identities will remain confidential throughout the study and will not be disclosed or used in any reports or publications. All data collected will be anonymized, and only authorized members of the research team will have access to identifiable information.

The researchers took steps to minimize harm by carefully managing questions and discussions related to bullying, ensuring that sensitive topics were approached with caution to avoid traumatizing participants or triggering emotional distress. Because bullying is a sensitive issue, counseling services were provided as a source of support to help participants who may experience emotional stress during or after the study. The participants were also informed of external mental health resources available to those who required further professional help.

This study received ethical approval from the Bandung Islamic University Health Research Ethics Committee (KEPK UNISBA), which ensured that all procedures were conducted in accordance with ethical standards and prioritized the well-being of participants.

Procedure

An online pre-survey, including questionnaires and interviews conducted by the researcher, was conducted to identify individuals who met the population criteria. From this pre-survey, 22 subjects were selected. Based on further assessment, the study then focused on 3 subjects who were willing to complete all counseling sessions. The selection of a smaller sample was a strategic decision aimed at ensuring more in-depth and consistent data collection.

Before starting the implementation stage, the purpose of the research was explained to the subjects, who were subsequently asked for their willingness to participate in the research. In this case, the confidentiality of the data was explained to the subjects, the intervention was carried out under the supervision of a psychologist, and informed consent was obtained from the subjects.

Before giving the intervention, a pre-test was conducted on the research subject to determine self-esteem using an organization-based self-esteem measuring instrument before being given the intervention. Then, the intervention process, namely, the patient-based reframing technique, was carried out for the research subject. The process was ended by conducting a post-test on the research subject to determine self-esteem after being given the intervention using an organization-based self-esteem measuring instrument and terminating the intervention.

Intervention Design

The intervention implementation was conducted by the researcher under the supervision of a psychologist. After each session, the researcher reported the activities and evaluated the session under the psychologist's supervision. The total duration of this study for participants willing to participate from the beginning at the end of the sessions was 5 weeks. This includes the time required for completing all 5 face-to-face counseling sessions, with each session scheduled weekly with a duration of 90 minutes per session. The intervention was conducted individually in the counseling room. Providing patience-based reframing techniques has 6 stages, namely:

1. Rationalization

This stage aims to provide knowledge and convince the three subjects that wrong thinking can cause emotional distress, that is, thoughts have a relationship and can affect feelings and behavior. The subjects are given a task related to writing a narrative about their thoughts and feelings about the situation they are experiencing and will be compared with the narrative writing at the end of the session using patient framing.

2. Identification of thoughts, feelings, and behaviors that arise when confronted with workplace bullying situations.

At this stage, the aim is to make the subjects aware that realizing and identifying can help them deal with future problems. The three subjects were helped identify using a worksheet by writing down the situations experienced and trying to remember the automatic thoughts that arose as well as the feelings and behaviors that emerged.

3. Elaboration of the thoughts underlying the problem

At this stage, the intention is that the three subjects explore irrational thoughts that cause negative emotions that are felt to disturb the subject. At this stage, the three subjects learned about the types of thought distortions and identified their thoughts, including the type of thought distortion. After identifying this issue, a discussion is held related to the distortion of thoughts, which can affect feelings and behavior, as well as the meaning of the situation.

4. Identification of alternative perceptions

At this stage, the three subjects will be able to change their negative thoughts and interpretations of the situation they are experiencing and be able to choose a new perspective using knowledge related to patience, namely firmness, steadfastness and perseverance, to determine better perceptions in dealing with bullying situations. The explanation of patience and its three aspects of firmness, steadfastness, and persevering through the verses of the Qur'an is given to the subjects. Discussing the Qur'anic verses is implemented in the subject's experience with the expectation of highlighting the importance of this in changing the subject's perspective of the current situation.

After that, the three subjects wrote on worksheets related to self-esteem sources that come from themselves and others with the aim that the subject has evidence related to the successes they have, the influence they have, the acceptance they experience, and the positive things that are the advantages of the subject, which can be evidence related to realizing that self-esteem is not low.

5. Cognitive Restructuring

At this stage, the three subjects hope that their negative thoughts cause low self-esteem, which can be improved with constructive and positive thoughts in dealing with difficulties or problems. The three subjects practiced modifying and switching old thoughts to new ones by presenting alternative thoughts based on knowledge and understanding related to the implementation of patience in their life situations and evidence of self-esteem sources. After that, a discussion was held regarding the selection of new thoughts and perspectives and another discussion regarding the relationship between new thoughts and perspectives using the

knowledge that patience can increase self-esteem.

6. Assignment

The three subjects were given a final assignment related to writing a narrative as at the beginning of the session but using the new framing that had been learned, namely, patience. The rewriting with a different framing can hopefully produce changes in the thoughts and feelings of the three participants.

Measures

The measuring instrument used for this study was the Organization-Based Self-Esteem (OBSE) scale from [Pierce \(1989\)](#), which was translated into Indonesian and modified through expert judgment by [Fabiola \(2022\)](#). This measuring instrument is used because it can measure specific self-esteem in relation to the amount of self-assessment the subject has made in the workplace. The measuring instrument features 10 statement items. Each item reflects how workers evaluate the extent to which they assess and believe they are valuable, capable, and important in the workplace. The measuring instrument was structured using a Likert scale model. This model consists of a number of statements with a tiered response of 5 answer options, namely "Strongly Disagree", "Disagree", "Undecided", "Agree", and "Strongly Agree".

The Organization-Based Self-Esteem measuring instrument translated and modified by [Fabiola \(2022\)](#) was validated through validation with construct validity techniques because the measuring instrument was standardized using the two-tailed Spearman rank correlation formula with the help of SPSS software version 23. The measuring instrument is considered valid because it has a correlation coefficient of >0.3 . Reliability tests were carried out using the Cronbach-Alpha technique. The Organization-Based Self-Esteem measuring instrument has an alpha coefficient of $\alpha = 0.892$. When referring to the Guilford correlation degree table, the Organization-Based Self-esteem measuring instrument refers to a high degree of correlation, so this measuring instrument can be used in further research.

Data Analyses

Data were analyzed using the Wilcoxon signed-rank test. This is a nonparametric test to measure the significance of differences between two groups of paired data with ordinal or interval scales but non-normal distribution. The Wilcoxon signed-rank test can be used when the same subject is in different measurement conditions (pre-test and post-test) without any limitation on the number of samples used. The calculation of this statistical test will be performed using SPSS.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This study includes three subjects, namely, individuals who experience bullying in the workplace and those with low self-esteem criteria. The reason for this limited number of studies was that the intervention used in the study has not been widely tested. The researcher chose to conduct an initial test on a small group before conducting a large-scale study to reduce the risk of wasted resources if the intervention is not effective. In this context, the focus is on validating methods or identifying early trends rather than making broad generalizations. We can think of this as a pilot study of a new type of intervention. In addition, in clinical psychology, especially research involving interventions, there are practical limitations, such as time and cost. In addition, there is the emotional vulnerability of many victims, who are in a fragile psychological state, making it difficult to obtain consent to participate. The identities of the three subjects were as follows:

Table 1. Research Subjects

	Subject 1	Subject 2	Subject 3
Gender	Female	Female	Female
Age	23 years	22 years	27 years
Duration of Bullying	1 year	9 months	1.5 years

Testing was performed using Wilcoxon tests, where if the significance value <0.05 then there is a significant difference, but if the significance value > 0.05 then there is no significant difference.

Table 2. Wilcoxon Pre-test and post-test

Test Statistics^a	
	Post-Test – Pre-Test
Z	-1,604 ^b
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	,109

a. Wilcoxon signed-rank test

b. Based on negative ranks.

Based on the test results listed in the table, it can be discerned that after providing treatment and administering the post-test, the significance value was $0.109 > 0.05$. Since the value of 0.109 is greater than > 0.05 , it can be concluded that there is no significant difference; thus, the provision of patience-based reframing techniques to increase self-esteem in individuals who experience bullying in the workplace does not have a significant effect.

This section presents the changes in self-esteem scores of all the research subjects. Overall, with the increase in the three aspects of being capable, significant, and worthy in the three subjects in this study, self-esteem in the context of work owned by the subject has increased. The measurement results obtained from the three research subjects are as follows:

Table 3. Measurement Results of Self-Esteem Subjects Before and After Being Given Patient-Based Reframing Technique

Patient Based Renaming Technique					
Subject	Self-Esteem				% Change
	Pre-Test		Post-Test		
	Score	Category	Score	Category	
Subject 1	19	Low	39	High	40,00%
Subject 2	23	Low	44	High	42,00%
Subject 3	21	Low	39	High	36,00%

Based on the table above, it appears that the three Research Subjects experienced a change or increase in Self-Esteem after being exposed to the intervention of the Patience-Based Reframing Technique. Subject 1 experienced an increase in Self-Esteem of 40.00% after the intervention of the

Patience-Based Reframing Technique. Subject 2 experienced an increase in Self-Esteem of 42.00% after being subjected to the intervention of the Patience-Based Reframing Technique. Finally, Subject 3 experienced an increase in Self-Esteem of 36.00% after being exposed to the Patience-Based Reframing Technique intervention.

Table 4. Results of an Organization-Based Self-Esteem Aspect Score Measurement Research Subjects Before and After the Patience-Based Reframing Technique

Aspect	Measurement Results					
	Subject 1		Subject 2		Subject 3	
	Pre-test	Post-test	Pre-test	Post-test	Pre-test	Post-test
Capable	7	12	7	14	7	13
Significant	4	8	4	9	4	7
Worthy	8	19	12	22	10	19

Based on the above table, in general, all subjects experienced an increase in each aspect; capable, significant, and worthy after receiving the intervention of the Patience-Based Reframing Technique. Based on this set of data, it can be said that the three subjects experienced changes, namely, an increase in Organization-Based Self-Esteem after receiving the intervention of the Patience-Based Reframing Technique.

Discussion

Statistical tests indicate that patience-based reframing techniques lead to differences in results but do not significantly increase self-esteem in workplace bullying victims. The statistically insignificant results could be due to the small amount of data, making it difficult to generalize the results to a wider population. With limited data, the sample representation may not reflect the true variation in the population, thus reducing confidence in the external validity of the study. This may also be due to the measurement of self-esteem, which requires a long time related to the formation of self-evaluation or self-esteem in individuals. Using a single subject experimental design to obtain more significant results. However, individual analyses revealed that these techniques could improve self-esteem, as evidenced by higher scores across all three aspects: feeling capable, significant, and worthy.

This can be gleaned from the three aspects of Self-Esteem experiencing an increase, which makes the subjects of this study able to evaluate themselves positively and interpret the situations they experience positively with a focus on feeling able to face challenges, feeling important, and feeling valuable. This finding is in line with research conducted by [Pierce and Gardner \(2004\)](#), which concluded that workers with high self-esteem feel competent in achieving goals. Workers will feel confident in their ability to face challenges and survive if they fail.

[Duffy and Atwater \(2002\)](#) stated that self-esteem is not something that already exists from birth in a person but rather the potential that can be improved and developed. Changes in self-esteem improvement are not immediately high, but with several sessions conducted and

interventions and evaluations related to the subject's self-assessment, these can hopefully change the previously negative self-assessment or appreciation to a positive one. The knowledge and identification process during the provision of patience-based reframing techniques can change the meaning of the situation in the three subjects. Previously, the subject interpreted the bullying situation he experienced as a weakness of his own and a painful experience. Therefore, the three subjects tended to focus on negative emotions and evaluate themselves negatively by regarding themselves as worthless and wondering why they had received such treatment.

The three subjects were trained with all stages in the patience-based reframing technique, including practicing the application of the Qur'anic verses related to being firm (QS. An-Nahl verse 42 and QS. Al-Baqarah verses 155- 156), steadfast (QS. Al-Anbiya, verse 35 and QS. Al-Insyirah, verses 5-6), and showing perseverance (QS. Ar- Ra'd, verse 11). As well as trying to identify the source of self-esteem, the subject becomes aware of the strength that has been hidden so far, the endurance possessed, and what efforts have been made to iron out the problems faced. This is in line with research conducted by [Schnitker \(2012\)](#), which links patience with self-esteem and a sense of self-control to help research subjects be more productive and work toward achieving their goals. In a sense, patience facilitates persistence when subjects strive to achieve their life goals. Enabled by the realization and knowledge of this, the three subjects thought that their negative thoughts and evaluations were not proven. They realize the positive experiences they have (such as acceptance of themselves, the success they have achieved, and the feeling of being useful) because their influence has helped many other colleagues and enabled them to express the positive things that exist in themselves. Patient behavior will direct individuals in a continuous effort to find solutions to achieve expectations, allowing individuals to train themselves to manage various existing resources to deal with and recover from stress ([Iacoviello & Charney, 2020](#)).

The opportunities afforded to the three subjects to implement positive thoughts and self-evaluations in their daily lives at work reinforced the process of evaluating their positive self-images. They began to feel the difference experienced in going through the day when the meaning of the situation changed. The feelings they experience become calmer, and the behaviors that arise are different; for example, when previously they had tended to feel sad and upset, which made them avoid interactions with others, now they feel they can engage with others with the capital of strength that they are already aware of. Individuals who have feelings of efficacy and competence, derived from experiences such as successful work or projects undertaken, will maintain a positive image of themselves ([Pierce & Gardner, 2004](#)).

There are differences in each subject in responding to the intervention. In subject 1, the subject understands that the bullying situation he is experiencing can indeed affect his self-esteem, but on the other hand, the subject also realizes that these things are Allah's way for the subject to have endurance and the ability to face and overcome problems, besides that related to feeling used by coworkers, the subject feels more reliable and competent in the field of work. Then, subject 2 feels that healing wounds related to bullying still takes time, but the subject understands that so far, the subject has often focused on the negative things that have happened to her.

Currently, the subject is trying to find a positive perspective on the problems that she has always seen as bad, and it turns out that the results make the subject think again that she found many people who appreciated her work, so she felt highly appreciated and cared for. Meanwhile, subject 3 felt helped when discussing Qur'anic verses about being firm, steadfast, and persevering. The subject feels strengthened that she can survive and is made aware of her efforts so far that the subject does not simply remain silent and passive when facing problems. With this realization, the subject feels calm and does not see herself as a broken person but sees herself as a person who can survive, has endurance, and fights against problems.

In the patience-based reframing technique, a narrative related to the bullying experienced by the subject is written at the beginning of the session and at the end of the session, but at the end of the session, the narrative is written using patient framing so that you can see the difference at the beginning of counseling and after attending. The three subjects are grateful to have made it through difficult times and to have left feelings of worthlessness behind. All subjects feel that they can slowly but surely regather their self-esteem, and all of them feel no need to think about the behavior of people who do not appreciate or underestimate because they do not know well, they do not know the potential of the subjects, and what bullies do does not necessarily make all the subjects lose their potential.

Evaluations of themselves have become increasingly positive, and the conditions experienced by the three subjects have increased their self-esteem. The self-esteem formed in the three subjects who experienced workplace bullying for the evaluation process that became more positive was also measured in the measurement of the sources of judgment about themselves that had developed. The three subjects who experienced workplace bullying developed a source of assessment as a self that can face challenges, an important self that can be useful to others, and a valuable self.

CONCLUSIONS

Statistical tests indicate that patience-based reframing techniques lead to differences in results but do not significantly increase self-esteem in workplace bullying victims. Admittedly, the small amount of data may have made it difficult to generalize the results to a wider population. However, individual analyses revealed that these techniques could improve self-esteem, as evidenced by higher scores across all three aspects: feeling capable, significant, and worthy. Although the statistical results showed a non-significant effect, the increase in scores showed that the intervention had an impact on improving the self-esteem of workers who experienced bullying. Patience-based reframing techniques are promising and easy to implement but need to be tested on a wider sample.

Implementing firmness, steadfastness, and perseverance in the experience of workplace bullying can help the subjects realize their potential, build confidence, build fighting power, and endurance, and increase their efforts to deal with or eliminate the problems they have been experiencing. With this, the subjects become aware of having the power to make decisions, being able to resist pressure to conform, express their thoughts and feelings, show a positive self-attitude, and be confident regarding the actions taken in overcoming problems and finally becoming more effective in meeting demands in the workplace.

By recognizing workplace bullying, it is expected that social and emotional support should be provided in the workplace. This can be accomplished through counseling and employee welfare programs. In addition, counseling on anti-bullying awareness can be provided widely, especially in organizations and companies. Providing patient-based reframing techniques is an intervention in the work environment that involves professionals trained in providing psychological support. Workers who experience bullying can be trained to increase self-awareness and self-evaluation to identify and evaluate internal resources and personal achievements positively.

LIMITATION & FURTHER RESEARCH

The limitations of this study can be identified in the research design. The researchers realized that measurements should be repeated using a single subject experimental design to obtain more significant results. This is because the measurement of self-esteem requires a long period related to the formation of self-evaluation. Another limitation is that this study did not discuss the extent to which the findings can be generalized to a larger population. The latter is important for

determining the relevance and application of the research results.

Future researchers could expand the number of populations and samples to make the research results more representative while still paying attention to the methods and approaches used. If they wish to conduct similar research using religion-based reframing techniques other than patience, they can conduct research using other Islamic-based psychology materials such as gratitude, *tawakkal* (reliance on Allah or trust in God's divine plan), and others that are in accordance with the handling of research problems.

REFERENCES

- Arroisi, J., Muhsinin, H. Z., & Fadlilah, A. R. (2024). Self-Transcendence in Transpersonal Psychology: A Critical Review from the Perspective of the Islamic Worldview. *International Journal of Emerging Issues in Islamic Studies*, 4(1), 69–81. <https://doi.org/10.31098/ijeis.v4i1.2432>.
- Barlow, D. H., & Nock, M. K. (2009). Why Can't We Be More Idiographic in Our Research?. *Perspectives on psychological science: a journal of the Association for Psychological Science*, 4(1), 19–21. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-6924.2009.01088.x>.
- Brown, J. D. (2010). High self-esteem buffers negative feedback: Once more with feeling. *Cognition and Emotion*, 24(8), 1389–1404. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02699930903504405>
- Cormier, W. H., & Cormier, L. S. (1985). *Interviewing strategies for helpers' fundamental skills and cognitive behavioral interventions* (2nd ed.). Brooks/Cole Pub. Co.
- Duffy, K. G., & Atwater, E. (2002). *Psychology for living: Adjustment, Growth, and Behavior Today* (7th ed). Pearson Education.
- Einarsen, S., Hoel, H., Zapf, D., & Cooper, C. (2002). Empirical findings on bullying in the workplace. In *Bullying and Emotional Abuse in the Workplace*. Taylor & Francis Inc.
- Fabiola, A. Z., & Prakoso, H. (2022). Pengaruh Organization Based Self-Esteem terhadap Work Engagement. *Bandung Conference Series: Psychology Science*, 2(1), 557–566.
- Iacoviello, B. M., & Charney, D. S. (2020). Cognitive and behavioral components of resilience to stress. In *Stress Resilience: Molecular and Behavioral Aspects* (pp. 23–31). <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-813983-7.00002-1>.
- Ibeagha, P. N., Balogun, S. K., & Adejuwon, G. A. (2004). Resiliency of Inner-City Yoruba University Undergraduates in South Western Nigeria. *Studies of Tribes and Tribals*, 2(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/0972639x.2004.11886512>
- Leymann, H. (1990). Mobbing and psychological terror at workplaces. *Violence and Victims*, 5(2), 119–126.
- Mruk, C. J. (2006). *Self-esteem research, theory, and practice: Toward a positive psychology of self-esteem*. Springer Publishing Company.
- Nielsen, M. B., Hetland, J., Matthiesen, S. B., & Einarsen, S. (2012). Longitudinal relationships between workplace bullying and psychological distress. *Scandinavian Journal of Work, Environment and Health*, 38(1), 38–46. <https://doi.org/10.5271/sjweh.3178>
- Nielsen, M. B., Skogstad, A., Matthiesen, S. B., Glasø, L., Aasland, M. S., Notelaers, G., & Einarsen, S. (2009). Prevalence of workplace bullying in Norway: Comparisons across time and estimation methods. *European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology*, 18(1), 81–101. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13594320801969707>
- Palmer, S. (2010). *Konseling dan Psikoterapi*. Pustaka Pelajar.
- Pierce, J. L., & Gardner, D. G. (2004). Self-esteem within the work and organizational context: A review of the organization-based self-esteem literature. *Journal of Management*, 30(5), 591–622.
- Pierce, J. L., Gardner, D. G., Cummings, L. L., & Dunham, R. B. (1989). Organization-Based Self-Esteem: Construct Definition, Measurement, and Validation. *Academy of Management Journal*,

- 32(3), 622–648. <https://doi.org/10.2307/256437>
- Ramilan, R., Mulyanti, R. Y., Koesmawan, K., & Wati, L. N. (2024). Role of Workplace Spirituality and Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) In Improving Lecturers' Performance. *People and Behavior Analysis*, 2(1), 48–60. <https://doi.org/10.31098/pba.v2i1.2278>
- Rosenberg, M., Schooler, C., Schoenbach, C., & Rosenberg, F. (1995). Global Self-Esteem and Specific Self-Esteem: Different Concepts, Different Outcomes. *American Sociological Review*, 60(1), 141–156. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2096350>.
- Sarkingobir, Y., Sharu, A. U., Sahabi, M., & Ashafa, N. A. (2022). Religious and Health Benefits of Salah/Prayer: A Review. *International Journal of Emerging Issues in Islamic Studies*, 2(2), 59–71. <https://doi.org/10.31098/ijeis.v2i2.1053>
- Schnitker, S. (2012). An examination of patience and well-being. *The Journal of Positive Psychology*, 7(4), 263–280. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17439760.2012.697185>
- Stark, A. M., Hopkins, S., & Fireman, G. (2022). The Framing of Past Bullying Experiences: Impact on Social Decision-Making, Emotions, and Predictions of the Future. *International Journal of Bullying Prevention*, 4(4). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s42380-021-00102-w>
- Suggala, S., Thomas, S., & Kureshi, S. (2020). Impact of Workplace Bullying on Employees' Mental Health and Self-Worth. In *The Palgrave Handbook of Workplace Well-Being*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-02470-3_30-1
- Verkuil, B., Atasayi, S., & Molendijk, M. L. (2015). Workplace bullying and mental health: A meta-analysis on cross-sectional and longitudinal data. *PLoS ONE*, 10(8). <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0135225>
- Wanders, F., Serra, M., & de Jongh, A. (2008). EMDR Versus CBT for Children with Self-Esteem and Behavioral Problems: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Journal of EMDR Practice and Research*, 2(3). <https://doi.org/10.1891/1933-3196.2.3.180>
- Yusuf, U. (2010). *Sabar (Konsep, Proposisi, dan Hasil Penelitian)*. Fakultas Psikologi Unisba.
- Yusuf, U. (2020). *Sabar sebagai Psychological Strength untuk Mencapai Kesuksesan Konsep, Indikator, dan Hasil Penelitian*. Prenadamedia Group.
- Zulfeqar, S. (2024). Exploring Ibn Taimiyyah's Model of Psychological Resilience in the Light of Islam and Psychology. *International Journal of Emerging Issues in Islamic Studies*, 4(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.31098/ijeis.v4i1.2355>